

THE BRODIE CLUBMinutes of the 868th Meeting

Date of Meeting: Tuesday, May 21, 1991

Place of meeting: Faunal Lab, South Borden Building

Chairman: Keith Reynolds; Recording Secretary: Norma Martin

The meeting was called to order at 8:00 p.m. Twelve members were present and four guests: Maudie Reynolds guest of Keith Reynolds, Jennifer Young guest of Don Young, Maryika Mychajlowycz guest of Howard Savage and our speaker Rick Lindgren.

Minutes of the previous meeting were read by Norm Martin. The minutes were approved with the following amendments:

P. 2, para. 5 - escarpment is 500 metres high; houses built of mud; para. 7 - 90 degrees; delete per hour; para. 8 - paleolithic

P. 4, para. 8 - Dewy

P. 5, para. 3 - delete fossils; para. 4 - 60-70 million years; para. 7 - Elba Cave; para. 7 - pika bones; para. 8 - 2 Ruby-crowned Kinglets

Announcements

Howard Savage stated that the library of the late Terry Shortt is to be moved from his home. The Ornithology Department of the ROM has selected the volumes to be housed in their library. Mrs. Shortt wishes the remainder of the 300-400 books could be kept intact and has asked the Brodie Club if they could accept them. The Brodie Club's cabinet in the Department of Ornithology would accommodate only half of the books. There are scientific books (some of Bent's life histories of birds), as well as coffee table and popular books (e.g. James Herriott books). Bill Carrick will ask someone at Metro Zoo if the zoo would like to have the books.

Howard Savage announced a wake for Rosie, the hippopotamus, to be held in his lab on Friday, May 25th, at 5 p.m.

The annual Brodie Club Field Day will be held on June 9 at the home of Harry Lumsden.

Norm Martin gave the FON announcements. A form is to be completed and sent to the FON to confirm the club's representative.

SPEAKER

Rick Lindgren was introduced by Norm Martin. Mr. Lindgren is a lawyer with the Canadian Environmental Law Association and is representing the Forest For Tomorrow coalition at the hearings of the Class Environmental Assessment of Timber Management on Crown Lands in Ontario.

## BACKGROUND FACTS

The Ministry of Natural Resources manages the resources within Ontario's Crown forests (approximately 37 million hectares). The MNR is seeking approval for its timber management planning process from the Environmental Assessment Board under the Environmental Assessment Act.

The MNR is concerned with four aspects of forest management:  
 1. access - the building of roads; 2. harvest; 3. renewal - planting and natural regeneration; 4. maintenance - spraying and protection.

This management process is what is being examined at the EA hearings. There are over 100 units of forest management in Ontario. The essential problem is that the ministry focuses on extraction of timber rather than taking a holistic approach which requires integrated management. The MNR has a narrow objective - to supply timber for mills. FFT claims all aspects should be considered.

Forests For Tomorrow began its submission to the board on October 1, 1990 and concluded in April, 1991. The submission consisted of 10 parts (panels) on various aspects of forestry.

The main point of FFT's presentation is that forests are complex ecosystems. There are thousands of species of plants and animals as well as other non-timber values such as the spiritual and recreational aspects. There has never been much emphasis on aspects other than timber.

## THE TOP 10 ISSUES

1. Clearcut size

Clearcutting is the most common harvesting procedure. The way and the scale on which it is done is unacceptable. Very large clearcuts of 1 000 to 269 000 hectares of contiguous clearcut areas have a devastating impact on the land aesthetically as well as through wind and soil erosion, rising water levels and ponding. FFT says there must be absolute limits, 100 hectares is the maximum size for jack pine. The shapes and sizes of cuttings have still not been determined but the days of large clearcuts are over. There must be a move from intensive management of clearcutting, planting and spraying to extensive management.

2. Full-tree logging

The practice of taking all debris from the site removes nutrients and a seed source. This type of harvesting must be restricted.

3. Wildlife management/biodiversity

Species management covers 70% of other species to be looked after. That leaves 30% unconsidered, e.g. pileated woodpecker, red-shouldered hawk. Caring for wildlife this way is a gamble. FFT recommends a comprehensive landscape approach to wildlife management. There should be a heterogeneous mix of landscape types resulting from different shapes and sizes of cuts.

4. Old growth

This has become a trendy issue but it is very important. There are late successional forests in Ontario. These stands provide a pool of genetic diversity which could be critical, as in the case of global warming. It is important to ensure that some stands grow into old growth.

5. Access planning

The MNR has no policy prohibiting roads in any part of Ontario. No area is protected apart from isolated tracts in provincial parks. The network of forest access roads is twice the size of the provincial highways system. (Mr. Lindgren is responsible for the proposed terms and conditions for roadless areas.)

This is one of the most contentious issues not only because of the impairment of the landscape but because roads open areas to other activities inconsistent with the area such as hunting and fishing. Roads can virtually eliminate the operation of remote tourist businesses.

FFT calls for:

- (A) the protection of some areas from roads
- (B) a more vigorous and comprehensive analysis be undertaken before a road is built.

6. Watercourse protection

Here FFT recommends the upgrading, improving and enforcing of guidelines for water protection. This includes better buffer zones around lakes and streams.

7. Integrated pest management

MNR has been committed to the heavy use of chemicals. FFT calls for an integrated pest management program without the use of chemicals. There would be a ban on the aerial application of herbicides and insecticides.

8. Provincial guidelines/manuals

Manuals must be upgraded to include, among other things, old growth and biodiversity.

9. Silvicultural data collection

The collection of data has been hopelessly inadequate. Data have not been collected in a useable or retrievable format. This system must be redressed. As a result of the EA hearing, however, information has become available that was not so before.

10. Forest management vs. timber management

Management can no longer focus on timber alone. The aim must be a healthy coexistence of all interests working in an integrated fashion.

THE FUTURE

The EA hearings continue now in smaller communities listening to individuals and nature groups. Next fall the Ontario Association of Anglers and Hunters will make their submission. In the fall of '92 the final arguments will be presented. The two lawyers for FFT will be working hard to clarify and focus the issues for the Board. There are over 2 000 exhibits and over 50 000 pages of transcripts.

The hearings will probably conclude in December 1992.

The findings of the Board will not be recommendations; they will be legally enforceable. There will be an ongoing need for groups such as FFT and the Canadian Environmental Law Association to see that new requirements for management of Crown Lands are carried out.

The Board has again asked for a negotiated settlement with MNR in the hope that the hearings can be brought to a speedier conclusion. The MNR was not prepared to negotiate at an earlier time and Mr. Lindgren was not hopeful that they will negotiate at this time either.

DISCUSSION AND QUESTIONS followed Mr. Lindgren's talk and slides illustrating some of his points.

The Board has asked MNR to compare the costs of clearcutting with modified cutting. Strip cutting and modified cutting eliminate extensive site preparation, planting and spraying. In the case of clearcutting the forest industry is heavily subsidized by the government through providing seedlings, subsidizing roads, insecticide spraying and providing the trees to harvest. It is tricky tracking down who pays for what.

Successful silviculture in Sweden is miniscule compared with our operation. Soil and climate there allow more intensive cultivation of trees. Almost all the trees are grown on private land, managed like an orchard. The whole operation does not make the country self-sufficient; they buy wood from Ontario. There is a problem of eutrication caused by fertilizers.

All MNR areas must have plans before cutting can proceed but some areas are cutting without a plan. There were more transgressors before the hearing started.

In Ontario trees are being harvested on a 60-80 year cycle. In 20 years there will be a short supply of wood. Younger trees will

be cut and there will be a junk forest.

Funding will be the Achilles heel of the Board's decision. Only 1.4% of the Ontario budget is allocated to MNR and a similar percentage to MOE.

Mr. Lindgren is confident that the Board will give a fair decision.

For a copy of the  
DRAFT TERMS AND CONDITIONS SUBMITTED BY FOREST FOR TOMORROW or  
information call:

FFT 924-3619

CELA 960-2284

The speaker was thanked by Jim Bendell followed by hearty applause.

#### Members' Notes

Lumsden - said it is a good year for swans.

Young - has seen a titmouse or two.

Huff - saw two swans at Davenport and Bathhurst, the headwaters of Taddle Creek.

Boissoneau - gave members a list of birds he has recorded in the Cannington area between 1970-91.

McNicol - reported that platforms put out at the Leslie St. spit after the terns return are being used by the terns. Birds were on the raft 17 minutes after the rafts arrived. An egg appeared on the last raft 2 days after the raft was positioned. There are 50 nests per raft. They are still nesting.

Speakman - showed slides of the two pileated woodpeckers at his home in Beaverton.

Bendell - reported on a study of shrew populations in jack pine plantations. The study showed the same number of individuals in areas treated with Bt as in areas untreated. In the treated areas, however, adult males had disappeared and the population consisted of young males and females. Young males have different requirements from old males.

Savage - stated that a thumb print in a piece of clay found near the border of New Mexico and Texas has been carbon dated at 35 000 b.p. The clay was unearthed 2 months ago and is scheduled to arrive in Toronto May 22/91 to be examined by an O.P.P. officer who is an expert on fingerprints. Laser techniques can find fingerprints on clothing and skin.

Adjournment - 10.35